



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record

September 13, 2016

Page 1

1. V-004-2016 – Public Way Vacation – Maple Lane from Wilkinson Street to Proctor Lane, and Proctor Lane from Maple Lane to West Fifth Street

Applicant: Dayton Campus Holdings LLC
444 West Third Street
Dayton, OH 45402

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown Neighborhood Planning District: Downtown

Decision: Postponed to a Later Meeting at Applicant's Request

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record September 13, 2016

2. S-024-2016 – Record Plan – Rosenthal Record Plan

Applicant: Mr. John Haley
Haley Dusa Group
270 Regency Ridge Drive
Dayton, OH 45459

Priority Land Use Board: Southeast Neighborhood Planning District: Walnut Hills
Decision: Approved with Conditions and a Variance for Lot Width

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report and the recommended conditions and variance for lot width. This is a consolidation of three city lots into two city lots.

Public Comments

None.

Board Discussion

The Plan Board discussed the case.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Wright, seconded by Mr. Payne and carried to approve Case S-024-2016 with the following conditions and variance:

1. The Zoning Code requires a minimum side setback of 3-ft within the MR-5 District. Locate on the Record Plan building footprints and dimensions of the side setbacks from the proposed property lines.
2. The Zoning Code requires minimum lot width of 30-ft within the MR-5 District. Pursuant to Section 151.134, a Variance is granted to reduce the minimum lot width to 29-ft for the northern lot.
3. Revise the Record Plan and any Construction Drawings per the City of Dayton Subdivision Regulations and comments from the Division of Civil Engineering.
4. Ensure that the dimensions close to within a 1:10,000 ratio.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Absent	Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes
Mr. David Bohardt	Absent	Mr. Matt Sauer	Abstain; arrived during presentation
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record September 13, 2016

3. S-025-2016 – Record Plan – Simms Monument Walk - A

Applicant: Mr. Charles Simms
Charles V. Simms Development Corporation
2785 Orchard Run Road
Dayton, OH 45449

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown Neighborhood Planning District: Downtown

Decision: Approved with Conditions

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report and the recommended conditions. This is replat to reduce the number of units in the development from 18 to 17 and create larger common areas as a result.

Public Comments

None.

Board Discussion

The Plan Board discussed the case.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Pegues, seconded by Mr. Payne and carried to approve Case S-025-2016 with the following conditions:

1. Revise the Record Plan and any Construction Drawings per the City of Dayton Subdivision Regulations and comments from the Division of Civil Engineering.
2. Show any new easements requested by DP&L, AT&T, Vectren, Water Engineering, etc.
3. Ensure that the dimensions close to within a 1:10,000 ratio.
4. TWC shall retain an easement for existing underground facilities.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Absent	Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes
Mr. David Bohardt	Absent	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record September 13, 2016

4. S-026-2016 – Record Plan – Dayton Metro Library

Applicant: Mr. Tim Kambitsch
Dayton Metro Library
215 East Third Street
Dayton, OH 45402

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown

Neighborhood Planning District: Downtown

Decision: Approved with Conditions

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report and the recommended conditions. This is subdivision of one city lot into four city lots.

Public Comments

None.

Board Discussion

None.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Wright, seconded by Mr. Payne and carried to approve Case S-026-2016 with the following conditions:

1. Revise the Record Plan and any Construction Drawings per the City of Dayton Subdivision Regulations and comments from the Division of Civil Engineering.
2. Show any new easements requested by DP&L, AT&T, Vectren, Water Engineering, etc.
3. Ensure that the dimensions close to within a 1:10,000 ratio.
4. Montgomery County's auditor maps show South Patterson Boulevard as being private property. The appropriate area of South Patterson Boulevard shall be dedicated with this record plan.
5. Montgomery County's auditor maps show a portion of East Fourth Street as being private property. The appropriate area of East Fourth Street shall be dedicated with this record plan, in accordance with the City's Thoroughfare Plan, which establishes the Fourth Street offset at 50 feet.
6. A minimum 15 foot radius curve on lot lines at the intersection of the east right-of-way line of South Patterson Boulevard and the north right-of-way line of East Fourth Street is required. The remainder shall be dedicated as new right of way as part of this replat.
7. A minimum 15 foot radius curve on lot lines at the intersection of the west right-of-way line of Wyandot Street and the north right-of-way line of East Fourth Street is required. The remainder shall be dedicated as new right of way as part of this replat.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Absent	Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes
Mr. David Bohardt	Absent	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record September 13, 2016

5. S-028-2016 – Record Plan – Student Suites Plat

Applicant: Mr. John Burkhardt
Burkhardt Engineering Company
28 North Cherry Street
Germantown, OH 45327

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown Neighborhood Planning District: Downtown

Decision: Approved with Conditions

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report and the recommended conditions. This is consolidation of many city lots into three city lots.

Public Comments

None.

Board Discussion

The Plan Board discussed the case.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Pegues, seconded by Mr. Wright and carried to approve Case S-028-2016 with the following conditions:

1. Revise the Record Plan and any Construction Drawings per the City of Dayton Revise the Record Plan and any Construction Drawings per the City of Dayton Subdivision Regulations and comments from the Division of Civil Engineering.
2. Show any new easements requested by DP&L, AT&T, Vectren, Water Engineering, etc.
3. Ensure that the dimensions close to within a 1:10,000 ratio.
4. Dayton’s Thoroughfare Plan calls for a 50 foot offset from the centerline of Fourth Street. To provide this offset, property will be required to be dedicated.
5. Dayton’s Thoroughfare Plan calls for a 49.5 foot offset from the centerline of Wilkinson Street. To provide this offset, property will be required to be dedicated.
6. A minimum 15 foot radius curve on lot lines at the intersection of the east right-of-way line of Wilkinson Street and the north right-of-way line of Fourth Street is required. The remainder shall be dedicated as new right of way as part of this replat.
7. A minimum 15 foot radius curve on lot lines at the intersection of the west right-of-way line of Ludlow Street and the north right-of-way line of Fourth Street is required. The remainder shall be dedicated as new right of way as part of this replat.
8. TWC shall retain an easement for existing underground facilities.
9. ATT shall retain an easement for existing underground ducts within the vacated Arcade Ln.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Absent	Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes
Mr. David Bohardt	Absent	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record September 13, 2016

6. S-029-2016 – Record Plan – Woessner Plat

Applicant: Mr. John Haley
Haley-Dusa Group
270 Regency Ridge Drive
Suite 203
Dayton, OH 45459

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown

Neighborhood Planning District: Urban Business District

Decision: Approved with Conditions

Staff Comments

Abigail Free presented the staff report and the recommended conditions. This is consolidation of many city lots into two city lots and a dedication of public right-of-way.

Public Comments

None.

Board Discussion

Done.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Payne, seconded by Mr. Sauer and carried to approve Case S-029-2016 with the following conditions:

1. Revise the Record Plan and any Construction Drawings per the City of Dayton Subdivision Regulations and comments from the Division of Civil Engineering.
2. Ensure that the dimensions close to within a 1:10,000 ratio.
3. The City of Dayton has no future plans to widen Webster Street and would like to extinguish Easement 11. Add a note to Easement 11 that labels it as extinguished. Language should be added with a signature block and notary's statement.
4. The Department of Water shall retain a 20-ft wide, centered easement for the existing 15" storm sewer running along Sears Street.
5. The Department of Water shall retain a 25-ft wide, centered easement for the existing 30" storm sewer running along Monument Avenue.
6. TWC shall retain an easement for existing aerial and underground facilities that are not found to be within the public right-of-way.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Absent	Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes
Mr. David Bohardt	Absent	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record September 13, 2016

7. Z-008-2016 – Zoning Map Amendment – Apply a Historic District (HD)-2 Overlay Zoning Designation to the James Robert DeWeese House at 136 West Monument Avenue (City Lot #20). The underlying zoning of CBD with a POD 2 Overlay will not change.

Applicant: Mr. Gary Blacklidge
1144 Gary Lane
New Carlisle, OH 45344

Priority Land Use Board: Downtown

Neighborhood Planning District: Downtown

Decision: Recommended Approval

Staff Comments

Rachel Bankowitz presented the staff report. She said staff believed the applicable determinations and findings can be made and recommended Plan Board approval of the case.

The James Robert DeWeese House is an elaborate Chateausque stone house erected ca. 1904. Located along Monument Avenue, once coined Dayton's "Mansion Row," it stands today as a reminder of our city's "Golden Era," a time when wealthy citizens built houses there to be closer to their downtown businesses. Nearly all of these houses are gone but the DeWeese House still stands as one of a few remaining downtown residences.

History:

The DeWeese House first appears in the 1904-1905 *Dayton City Directory*. James Robert DeWeese is listed as the owner, along with his wife, Laura Flavilla Tanner DeWeese. The same directory indicates Mr. DeWeese as president of the firm of DeWeese & Bidleman, downtown merchants. Mr. DeWeese passed away in 1917 but Laura continued to live in the house until at least 1928. At that time, Ralph Emerson DeWeese, their only child, became the owner. Ralph worked alongside his father but may be best known for his work as a banker and as president of the Dayton Electric Light Company and director of the Dayton & Muncie Traction Company. A 1963 article from the *Journal Herald* indicates that the house was sold outside the family in the 1950s to Dr. Robert E. Pumphrey. From that point on it generally fell into a commercial use, as Dr. Pumphrey maintained medical offices in the building. In 1963 Dr. Pumphrey sold the house to Barry Blacklidge, an accountant for Sinclair Community College. Blacklidge used the building as office space for the college as well as apartments, while a few physicians continued to maintain offices on the first floor. Today the building is vacant and Gary Blacklidge, son of Barry, is seeking this historic designation not only to recognize the building's historic and architectural significance, but also to potentially help secure historic tax credit funding for future development.

Architecture:

The DeWeese House is an exceptionally intact example of the Chateausque style and is therefore potentially eligible for the National Register of Historic Places under *Criterion C*, for its architecture. Chateausque is a rare style used primarily for architect-designed landmark houses. The earliest examples of the style occurred in the northeastern states in the late 1880s and 1890s. The style later spread throughout the country and persisted through the first decade of the twentieth century. As the name suggests, the Chateausque style is based on elements borrowed or adapted from French forms of architecture. Given the scale and sophistication associated with the Chateausque style, its popularity was principally limited to larger cities where the skills of architects and builders were available. Chateausque houses typically exude masonry construction, steeply pitched hipped and conical roofs, multiple gabled dormers and parapets, tall corbelled chimneys and Tudor or semi-elliptical arches. Single-family homes,

like the DeWeese House, typically have robust turrets or towers. Perhaps Dayton's most prominent example of the style is the Traxler Mansion on Yale Avenue in Dayton View.

Based on these factors, as well as the required standards listed below and the finding of eligibility of the Landmark Commission, staff recommends approval of the proposed zoning map amendment. Approval of the historic designation will recognize the significance of the property, protect it from incompatible alterations and demolition without a public hearing, and potentially allow for a greater range of financing options.

Public Comments

At its July 28, 2016, meeting, the Landmark Commission meeting supported the HD-2 designation for the building.

The applicant, Gary Blacklidge, 1144 Gary Lane, New Carlisle, OH, spoke in support of the application. He explained how his parents bought the house in 1963 from a physician who had purchased it from the DeWeese family. He described the tremendous amount of restoration work his parents did to the house. He said the family wants to protect the building in case there is a need to sell it in the future. The family does not want to see it become a parking lot.

Board Discussion

None.

Board Action

A motion was made by Mr. Payne, seconded by Mr. Sauer and carried to recommend City Commission approval of Case Z-008-2016 based on the Plan Board's ability to make the determinations specified in R.C.G.O. Section 150.125.7 as outlined in the staff report.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Absent	Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes
Mr. David Bohardt	Absent	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board



City of Dayton

City Plan Board

Summary Minute Record September 13, 2016

8. Z-009-2016 – Zoning Map Amendment – Amend the Area 1 Regulations of Planned Development PD-109 to Allow for an Apartment Building for Seniors

Applicant: Mr. Michael Krause
Audubon Crossing Limited Partnership
229 Huber Village Boulevard, Suite 100
Westerville, OH 43081

Priority Land Use Board: North Central Neighborhood Planning District: Old Dayton View

Decision: Approved with Conditions

Staff Comments

Jon White presented the staff report. He said staff believed the applicable determinations and findings can be made and recommended Plan Board approval of the case.

In 2001, the City Plan Board approved Planned Development Overlay PD-109 for a Dayton View Hope VI project today known as Audubon Crossing. The proposal was a Federal Hope VI initiative which included the demolition of high-density public housing and replacing it with low-density housing that would reflect the surrounding area's size and scale. The project demolished a total of 213 units of substandard public housing, developed 50 single and two family rental units, constructed and rehabbed 100 single and two-unit for sale housing, constructed a 30-unit "Senior Village", and reintroduced the street grid into the urban fabric.

PD-109 contained two conjoined areas each with specific development standards called Area 1 and Area 2.

PD-109 Amendment Proposal

The proposed PD-109 Audubon Crossing project is a 3-story 50-unit apartment building for senior residents, containing one and two bedroom living units and community spaces. The project is proposed to go on an existing vacant area that was initially designated to be a 194-space surface parking lot on the northeast section of Area 1 of PD-109. No modifications are proposed for Area 2. The site is located adjacent to the current HOPE VI development. Access to the site will be provided via an access drive off of Edgewood Avenue. A pavilion will provide outdoor space for the residents, and a plaza area will be located to welcome pedestrian traffic to the site. Additionally, a secondary entrance will be located at the northeast corner of the building to provide access to and from Salem Avenue.

Land Use:

The applicant does not request that the subject property be rezoned to include a Senior Living Facility as a permitted use. Mature Residential MR-5 will remain the underlying zoning and the Planned Development Overlay will include the development standards. The proposal is to construct a three story 50-unit Senior Facility on 1.756 acres. The density will be approximately 29.7 units per acre.

Off-Street Vehicle Parking:

The facility will be served by a 52-spaced surface parking lot located directly south of the facility. The lot will be access from Edgewood Avenue on the southeast section of the site. The entire perimeter of the parking lot will be landscaped including trees, shrubs, and berm. Two 9'0 x 36'0 landscaping islands will be included in the parking lot interior. Parking will be approximately 1.04 spaces per unit.

Traffic and Pedestrian Access:

Pedestrian and vehicular access will be located via Edgewood Avenue at the southeast corner of the site. Currently, a 33' wide public access easement extending from Edgewood Avenue to the Yuma Place alley directly to the south of the site exists. The driveway entrance to the site and parking lot will extend from this access point. Vehicular traffic circulation will be similar to the original intent of PD-109.

Pedestrian access points will also be created on the southwest and northeast sections of the site. The northeast access point will extend from a back building entrance onto a perimeter sidewalk which will connect the site to Salem Avenue. The southwest access point includes a small plaza with pavers and will provide pedestrian access onto Yuma Place alley. The Yuma Place alley will connect the site to a small park and walking path just west of Middle Street in the Hope VI development area. Sidewalk is also proposed around the perimeter of the parking lot as well as along the western and northern perimeter of the site.

Freestanding Signs:

Site entrance signs were not included with the PD application. Freestanding signs will be subject to underlying zoning regulations.

Architectural Features:

The proposed Senior Living Facility will be three stories and approximately 47' to the top of the roof. The building façade will include a brick veneer along with insulated vinyl siding. The building roof will be a 6:12 pitch and include 30-year architectural shingles. The front façade treatment reflects and is compatible with the two-story structures in the area. Total building area will be approximately 51,508 G.S.F.

Conclusion:

Overall, Planning staff supports the proposed PD-109 amendment. Although a 50-unit Senior Living Facility will be a significant change from the 194-space parking lot as proposed in the adopted PD-109, the proposed project will be a quality design with a number of landscaping and pedestrian improvements. Staff is concerned with the lack of street frontage for the facility as it does not follow good Urban Design and Pedestrian Oriented Design Standards. With that being said, the pedestrian connections planned on the site should provide adequate access to existing pedestrian facilities and ameliorate the lack of street frontage.

Public Comments

A letter from John Gower, 1008 West Grand Avenue, Dayton, OH, which stated the reasons he did not support the proposal, was provided to the Plan Board.

The Northcentral Land Use Board voted to support the Area 1 Amendment to allow for a 50-unit senior living facility. At the Land Use meeting, concerns were voiced about the one-way in one-way out vehicular access, resident access to fresh food/grocery, and pedestrian safety on Yuma Place. The community expects to continue to work with the developer and GDPM on site design.

The applicant, Michael Krause, Audubon Crossing Limited Partnership, 229 Huber Village Boulevard, Suite 100, Westerville, OH, and property owner, GDPM, represented by Kiya Patrick, 400 Wayne Avenue, Dayton, OH, spoke in support of the project and answered questions from the Plan Board. They said the application requires more community engagement which will be done. The public involvement scale for a one building, tax credit project is different than what is required for an entire HOPE VI project. Other sites are not available. The design is preliminary and lots of design work is yet to be done. A final

application which confirms that proper zoning is in place for the project is due November 22, 2016. GDPM doesn't want to lose the funding available for this \$10 million project. Senior housing is a complementary use here and there is a market for it.

Steve Makovec, Co-President, Jane Reece Neighborhood Association, 23 Dayton Avenue, Dayton, OH, said he first learned about this project two weeks ago. The neighborhood association hasn't been notified officially of the project and there hasn't been a chance to bring the neighborhood together to discuss it. The community was well engaged in the HOPE VI project. It is disappointing not to be involved on this piece. He saluted DMHA and the HOPE VI project which remade the area and created a livable, quiet residential environment. He explained the history of Omega Church's expected role in the HOPE VI project which did not come to fruition.

Dianne James, President, Ole Dayton View Neighborhood Association, 123 Audubon Park, Dayton, OH, said everyone in her neighborhood received notice about the project but the Jane Reece neighborhood did not. She is in favor of the project. GDPM worked closely with her to put a walking path in the neighborhood. She would like to see more improvements in the neighborhood, not empty lots. She would rather have something than nothing. She loves her neighborhood; it is one of the best in the city.

Board Discussion

The Plan Board discussed the case.

Ms. Pegues asked why the original proposal wasn't built and Mr. Payne, who worked for DMHA on the HOPE VI project, explained the HOPE VI project's background.

Mr. Payne said the proposed building doesn't blend in because it's too tall; it's not a realistic design. He asked if the number of units could be reduced and why the proposal did not include balconies. Balconies were a feature seniors desired and that feature was incorporated into the HOPE VI project's current senior housing building. He was ambivalent about trying to put housing where it was never intended to be.

Mr. Sauer said the site's connectivity was poor; there is no access to Salem Avenue. There is no public street frontage and poor pedestrian connections to existing sidewalks. He was fine with the proposed density; the siting was a problem.

Mr. Wright said he hated to see the opportunity to use the available funding lost but we have to recognize the longevity of these projects. It should complement what's there. He was concerned about density.

Staff will have to look at whether Berm Street, part of which is adjacent to the site and vacated, can be used to provide access to the project.

Mr. Scott said he saw the concerns of Plan Board members involving three things: massing, site configuration, and pedestrian access. He proposed that the Plan Board recommend amendments to the Area 1 Planned Development regulations that:

- Allow for a Multi-family senior living facility;
- Allow the Plan Board to grant a variance to the maximum building height requirement for multi-family structures; and
- Allow the Plan Board to grant a variance to the roof pitch requirements for multi-family structures.

Staff said that in accordance with the existing Planned Development regulations, the site design would return to the Plan Board for approval. Plan Board members agreed with Mr. Scott's proposal.

Board Action

A motion was made by Ms. Pegues, seconded by Mr. Payne and carried to recommend City Commission approval of Case Z-009-2016 to amend the Area 1 Planned Development regulations of PD-109 to allow for a multi-family senior living facility; allow the Plan Board to grant a variance to the maximum building height requirement for multi-family structures; and allow the Plan Board to grant a variance to the roof pitch requirements for multi-family structures. The recommendation was based on the Plan Board's ability to make the determinations specified in R.C.G.O. Section 150.125.7 as outlined in the staff report.

Ms. Beverly Pendergast	Absent	Mr. Jeff Payne	Yes
Mr. David Bohardt	Absent	Mr. Matt Sauer	Yes
Mr. Richard Wright	Yes	Mr. Greg Scott	Yes
Ms. Geraldine Pegues	Yes		

Minutes approved by the City Plan Board on October 11, 2016.

Ann Schenking, Secretary
City Plan Board