

On Wednesday, January 25, 2023, at 8:31 a.m., the Dayton City Commission met in regular session in the Commission Chambers of City Hall.

**CALL TO ORDER**

Mayor Mims called the meeting to order.

**INVOCATION**

Commissioner Joseph gave the invocation.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

Mayor Mims led the public in the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

Roll call was taken, and Mayor Mims, Commissioners Joseph, Shaw, Fairchild and Turner-Sloss were present. The Clerk of Commission, Ms. Regina Blackshear and the City Manager, Ms. Shelley Dickstein were also present.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Commissioner Shaw made a motion to approve the minutes from the January 18, 2023, meeting. Commissioner Fairchild seconded the motion. The previous meeting minutes were unanimously approved.**

**COMMUNICATIONS AND PETITIONS**

There were no communications or petitions.

**SPECIAL AWARDS/PRESENTATIONS**

There were no awards or presentations.

**ADDITIONS OR DELETIONS TO THE CALENDAR**

There were no additions or deletions to the calendar.

**DISCUSSION OF CALENDAR ITEMS**

**Calendar Item No. 3. Expressions of Live Inc. – Grant Agreement**

The City Manager, Ms. Shelley Dickstein, said the grant agreement addresses health and food insecurity for low-income families.

**Calendar Item No. 5. New Beginnings For You – Grant Agreement**

The City Manager, Ms. Shelley Dickstein, said the grant agreement will revitalize a building to house offices, training and testing center.

**Calendar Item No. 4. Frost Brown Todd LLC – Service Agreement**

The City Manager, Ms. Shelley Dickstein, said the police reform oversight group created an independent accountability auditor position to further improve transparency oversight and accountability of the City of Dayton Police Department. She said it will strengthen its relationship with the community per the ordinance. Ms. Dickstein said the Independent Accountability Auditor contracted position will report to both the City Commission and City Manager. She said two RFQ's were let go in order to fulfill this need. She said the first effort was unsuccessful because they had one response, which was found to be non-responsible. There was a second RFQ that was released after updated scope and scoring criteria. Three responses to the second RFQ were received on July 21<sup>st</sup>. The responses were from Frost Brown and Todd and Porter Wright Morrison Arthur and Barry Shea.

Ms. Dickstein said an evaluation team consisted of members from the Law Department, HRC, the Commission Office, Police Department and two community representatives who participated in the police reform process. She said Barry Shay requested to withdraw their response halfway through the process, therefore, the remaining two responses received final scores. The purchasing agent facilitated the process on behalf of the city. She kept all the individual scores provided by each committee member and provided the summary evaluation scores to the group. Ms. Dickstein said Frost Brown and Todd scored the highest and their pricing submittal was then opened which moved into negotiations in accordance with the RFQ process and then they were able to successfully negotiate with Frost Brown Todd.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said she will be voting no on this calendar item because it doesn't meet the expectations of the oversight committee. She said the agency has a long-standing working relationship with the City of Dayton Law Department.

Commissioner Fairchild asked about the significance of the agreement residing with the Law Department.

Ms. Dickstein invited Ms. Torey Hollingsworth, Director of the Commission Office to the podium to provide clarification.

Ms. Hollingsworth said because the Commission Office and the City Manager's office works closely with the Law Department it was the only way to have dual management.

Commissioner Fairchild asked if the Law Department has a supervisory role.

Ms. Hollingsworth said the contract is out of the Law Department's budget. Ms. Dickstein said typically they will provide the oversight with regards to billing and input if there is conflict.

Commissioner Fairchild said he will be voting no on this agreement because the citizens wanted independence. He said the agreement was that the City Commission would be responsible for the hiring and firing of the Independent Accountability Auditor (IAA).

Commissioner Shaw asked about the support for the agreement with Frost Brown Todd LLC.

Ms. Dickstein said there was unanimous support, and they had the highest score.

Commissioner Joseph said his committee made the recommendation. He said they spent time working through preconceptions and trying to look at things through someone else eyes. He said he thinks his colleagues are voting no because of a disgruntle committee member. He said the IAA was created to address the need that when someone has a bad interaction with police, they will be able to make a complaint to the City Commission. He said they modeled the idea of the IAA from other cities. Commissioner Joseph assured citizens that Oversight committee is in support of the IAA.

Commissioner Fairchild said it wasn't fair or accurate to say he is voting no because of a disgruntled committee member. He said he spoke to people who didn't agree in the beginning or it didn't hit the mark of the position description. He said he wanted to be clear that he was not speaking on behalf of a small subset.

Commissioner Joseph said he wanted to be clear the opinions that he is hearing is from a small minority of the committee. He said the overall committee is in full support.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said to clarify that she is in support of the IAA but she is not in support of awarding the contract to Frost Brown Todd LLC because of the long standing relationship between this firm and the City of Dayton's Law Department.

## **REPORTS**

### **1. Purchase Orders, Agreements and Contracts:**

**(All contracts are valid until delivery is complete or through December 31<sup>st</sup> of the current year).**

#### **PUBLIC WORKS**

**A1. Deere & Company** (six commercial stand-up mowers) **\$47,127.12**

**A2. Jack Doheny Companies, Inc. dba Jack Doheny Company** (one Elgin brand street cleaner) **300,559.45**

#### **WATER**

**B1. Cellco Prtnshp dba Verizon Wireless** (cellular telephones, broadband card services and related items as needed through 12/31/26) **\$48,000.00**

-Depts of Public Works and Water.

**Total: \$395,686.57**

2. **Dayton Access Television, Inc. (DATV) – Contract Modification** – to provide public access services to the community – City Manager's Office/Public Affairs. **\$372,400.00**  
**(Thru 2/01/24)**
3. **Expressions of Life Inc. – Grant Agreement** – Dayton Recovery Plan – to purchase current building location and pay for construction/renovation services to build out the Community Center – Department of Human Resources. **\$147,000.00**  
**(Thru 12/31/26)**
4. **Frost Brown Todd LLC – Service Agreement** – for Independent Accountability Auditor position to further improve transparency, oversight, and accountability of the City of Dayton Police Department – Department of Law/Civil Division. **\$100,000.00**  
**(Thru 01/31/24)**
5. **New Beginnings For You – Grant Agreement-** Dayton Recovery Plan – for building renovation that will house offices, a job training and testing center, mental health counseling center, and life skills training center - Department of Procurement, Management and Budget. **\$250,000.00**  
**(Thru 12/31/26)**

**C. Revenue to the City:**

6. **Stillwater Canoe Club LLC – Lease Agreement** – for property located at 1026 Riverside Drive, Dayton OH 45405 – Department of Public Works/Property Management. **\$14,066.48**  
**(Thru 12/31/32)**

**E. Other – Contributions, etc.:**

7. **Dayton City Acquisition, II LLC – Other** – for special use permit to construct a roof canopy and footing for the passenger drop-off of the AC Hotel – Department of Public Works/Civil Engineering. **\$968.00**  
**(Paid to City)**

**CITIZENS’ COMMENTS ON CALENDAR ITEMS:**

Citizen comments on calendar items were received from the following:

1. **Ms. Valerie Duncan, 523 Hayden Ave.** – spoke in opposition of Resolution No. 6704-23-about the Adopting the Comprehensive Plan Entitled “Dayton Forward: 2040 Comprehensive Plan.”

The mayor asked that the item be separated from the other City Manager’s Reports in order to be voted on separately.

**APPROVAL OF CITY MANAGER’S REPORTS**

**Commissioner Fairchild made the motion to approve the City Manager’s Reports minus Calendar Item No. 4. Commissioner Shaw seconded the motion. The City Manager’s Reports were approved with a 5-0 vote. Voting in the affirmative were Commissioners Joseph, Shaw, Fairchild and Turner-Sloss.**

**Commissioner Joseph made the motion to approve the City Manager’s Reports Calendar Item No. 4. Commissioner Shaw seconded the motion. The City Manager’s Reports were approved with a 3-0-2 vote. Voting in the affirmative were Mayor Mims, Commissioners Joseph and Shaw. Voting in the negative are Commissioners Fairchild and Turner-Sloss.**

**LEGISLATION**

**EMERGENCY RESOLUTION – FIRST READING**

**Emergency Resolution No. 6705-23-** Authorizing the Acceptance of a Bridge Loan for an Environmental Justice Program from Southeast Ohio Public Energy Council (dba Sustainable Ohio Public Energy Council) on Behalf of the Sustainability Office of the City of Dayton in an Amount Not to Exceed Twenty Thousand Dollars and Zero Cents (\$20,000.00), and Declaring an Emergency.

**Commissioner Joseph moved that this being an emergency measure for the immediate consideration of the Resolution. Commissioner Turner-Sloss seconded the motion. The motion was passed with a 5-0 vote.**

### **ORDINANCE – SECOND READING**

**Ordinance No. 32019-23-** Consenting to the Guardrail Replacement on SR 444 0.435 to 0.446, 0.535 to 0.546 and on Terminal Drive MR 5093 1.725 to 1.735 in the City of Dayton, and Agreeing to Cooperate in Matters Incidental Thereto, Including the Execution of Agreement Necessary to Implement this Ordinance.

**The question being shall Ordinance No. 32019-23 be passed. A roll call vote was taken resulting in a 5-0 vote. Voting in the affirmative were Mayor Mims, Commissioners Joseph, Fairchild and Turner-Sloss. The Ordinance was passed.**

**Ordinance No. 32020-23-** Amending the Official Zoning Map to Establish Planned Development-185 for 2.32 Acres at the Southeast Corner of North Main and Hershey Streets.

**The question being shall Ordinance No. 32020-23 be passed. A roll call vote was taken resulting in a 5-0 vote. Voting in the affirmative were Mayor Mims, Commissioners Joseph, Fairchild and Turner-Sloss. The Ordinance was passed.**

### **RESOLUTION – SECOND READING**

**Resolution No. 6704-23-** Adopting the Comprehensive Plan Entitled “Dayton Forward: 2040 Comprehensive Plan.”

**The question being shall Resolution No. 6704-23 be adopted. A roll call vote was taken resulting in a 5-0 vote. Voting in the affirmative were Mayor Mims, Commissioners Joseph, Fairchild and Turner-Sloss. The Resolution was adopted.**

### **PUBLIC HEARING**

Mayor Mims opened the Public Hearing regarding the 2023 Annual Appropriations. He asked Ms. Dickstein to proceed. Ms. Dickstein said this year’s budget addresses the priorities of demolition, housing, park, and youth. She said it includes \$18.2M in demolition, \$23.8M in housing \$5.7M to address vacant land issues and \$18M for youth investment. She said she is proud of leadership and the excellent work of Ms. Monica Jones, Acting Director of Procurement Management and Budget. Ms. Dickstein said the presentation will include an overview of the Guiding Budget Principles and finish with key dates.

Ms. Jones said the public hearing is required by both the Ohio Revised Code and the City Charter.

Ms. Jones said she will go over the overview of guiding budget principles and assumptions, the summary of the budget process to date, 2023 proposed budget, give a brief overview of additional identified priorities and related funding, differences between temporary and original appropriations and key dates.

Ms. Jones said the projected revenues, combined with any planned use of reserves and one-time funding (e.g., ARPA), provide the maximum limit for departmental budgets. Departmental allocations are based on City Commission priorities, City Manager recommendations, departmental inputs, performance management KPIs, and funding mandates (e.g., Your Dollars, Your Neighborhood, and the Dayton Recovery plan). She said the one-time funding will be used for: one-time expenses that reduce future operating costs, increase future revenues, or reduce legacy liabilities, and easing the burden associated with a major economic downturn during a 24-month period.

Ms. Jones said the summary of the budget process to date is gathering of public input (Dayton Survey, Dayton Open Data, community conversations, CNDAB), Identifying Priorities, and communicating policy goals. She said the key people are Dayton residents, businesses and stakeholders, City Commission, City Manager's Office, Procurement Management and Budget, department directors and fiscal staff. Ms. Jones said the administrative processes are revenue projections, expense projections, draft budgets, department submission and review, publications and public hearing, and passage of the appropriations.

Ms. Jones said the policy budget framework include City Commission priorities, program objectives, program results, and community outcomes. She said Community Service Areas (CSAs) are comprised of program areas made up of departments and divisions providing services that share an integrated mission to address City Commission priorities. She said CSAs are linked together to form the framework for the City's Policy Budget.

Ms. Jones said the General Fund expenditure assumptions are personnel cost growth, contracts and materials, capital equipment allocation, capital projects, development, demolition, Issue 9 services and investments, and budget gap.

Ms. Jones said the City of Dayton received \$138M of ARPA funding. She said \$101.9M funded the Dayton Recovery Plan including: \$55M for improving our neighborhoods, \$7.6M supporting black and brown businesses, \$7.1M aiding community and small business recovery, \$10.7M catalyzing economic recovery, \$21.5M enhancing critical City services. She said to date, the Dayton Recovery Plan has obligated \$20.4M in planned projects, \$36.1M to cover future revenue loss to maintain City services.

Ms. Jones said youth investments include \$4.3M Preschool Promise for three and four-year-old, \$4.1M for recreation, and \$1.7M for Golf. She said \$1.0M in CDBG discretionary funding identified and earmarked in December, \$10.6M for youth programs, services, and infrastructure in several areas across the organization \$800K in the department operation budget for various youth programs including: Police and Fire Dayton Public Schools training programs, Police and Youth Spring/Summer camps, and a new Police youth outdoor adventure pilot for young people coping with anxiety and/or stress disorder, Bosnian exchange youth leadership program, Children's Water festival, McIntosh and SOCHE internship programs

Dayton Fire Chief Lykins, Dayton Fire Department, said the proposed 2023 budget includes a new \$1M in additional services and staffing. He said they are asking for \$569,800 for an EMS pilot program to provide additional EMS response and transport capability. He said nine additional EMTs will be approved in 2023 budget. The pilot program was launched on November 28, 2022. He said 61 percent of the time, the extra transport unit was staffed as an Advance Life Support (ALS) unit and 39 percent of the time the extra transport unit was staffed as a Basic Life Support (BLS) unit. He said he is proposing \$434,900 be approved for temporary overfill to address historically high overtime and to provide relief to front-line staff with three additional EMTs and fire fighters.

Ms. Erica Fields, Director of the Human Relations Council, said the proposed 2023 budget of \$1.1M includes nine full-time employees (FTE), Contracts and Materials, Community Appeals Board (CAB), employee travel and training, BTA education and outreach, supplies and materials, printing and mailing and marketing. She said the MBAC grant budget supports three FTE with state funding and city cash match (25 percent of the total grant program)

Ms. Fields said the 2023 Work Plan and Resource Allocation Business Technical Assistance (BTA) Program oversees local, state and federal certification program for business inclusion and federal requirements for 2023. She said it will bring visibility to city efforts to promote equitable economic inclusion; and ensure organizations receiving ARPA funding can meet inclusion goals and relate to a pool of certified minority vendors to perform work. Ms. Fields said it will introduce new and limited contracting minority business enterprises to prime contractors through business matchmaking events and activities; contract-specific outreach events; and meetings with industry organizations (Dayton Business Matchmaker).

Ms. Fields said the MBAC Program ensures that the hardest to reach minority business enterprises are informed of general and upcoming opportunities and have the critical resources and assistance in the bidding process.

Ms. Fields said the Justice and Inclusion Program will oversee and staff the community appeals board, facilitate public hearings for community members, and host related education and training events, enforce local, state and federal civil rights laws pertaining to housing, public accommodation, employment and credit transactions, coordinate comprehensive and intersectional education, outreach and training plans designed to help partners prevent and eliminate discrimination of people of color, immigrants, people with disabilities, LGBTQ and other underrepresented and protected groups

Mr. Todd Kinskey, Director of Planning Neighborhoods and Development, said they are proposing \$18.2M to address demolition. He said \$15.8M in the Dayton Recovery Plan includes demolition, historic stabilization, and blight removal. He said his budget also includes converting unproductive property into productive property and vacant lot management through *"Your Dollars Your Neighborhood"*.

Mr. Kinskey said the Dayton Recovery Plan will include vacant lot cleanup and the Tree Lawns Program that will remove debris and bush on vacant lands and tree and stump removal across the city, and the Vacant Lot/Property Improvement Program which will include a Hydroponics farm on a formally vacant lot in Edgemont neighborhood by Five Rivers Health Center, transfer Lorenz and Delaware Avenues to The Conscious Connect Redevelopment Corporation to construct West Dayton Pocket Park and the Northwest Health and Wellness Center on the former Good Sam Hospital site.

Mr. Kinskey said the CDBG Vacant Property Improvement program includes Development and construction of a new Head Start facility, construction of the pharmacy and health clinic by Homefull Healthy Living, removal of vacant and obsolete convenience store near Ruskin School removal of the Daymont building for Germantown Crossing, and preparation and improvements for the Wright Factory site.

Mr. Kinskey said the Property Renovation and Disposition Program includes 11 forfeited Lot Links properties previously transferred to the Landbank will be renovated with a goal of being sold at market rate, 29 vacant parcels are planned to be sold through the online property disposition program, and four to five vacant structures are planned to be sold by end of 2023.

Mr. Kinskey said the Dayton Recovery Plan funded projects are the Wolf Creek Homes with County Corp, Hoover Flats -Senior Affordable Living, Longfellow Midtown, Grace Church Senior Living -National Church Residences, Kinship Care Family Housing at Dayton Children's Hospital, Twin Towers Tomorrow, Single-family owner-occupied homes for 80 percent to 120 percent Area Median Income, renovation of up to 100 homes by Rebuilding Together Dayton City of Dayton (COD) Preferred Property Program, critical roof, downspout

and gutter repairs by Habitat for Humanity, two affordable housing units planned to be built by OneFifteenRecovery. He said the HOME funded projects are Germantown Crossing, McLin Apartments, Cambridge Apartment Phase I, Hoover Place. Mr. Kinskey said the City of Dayton (COD) funded projects are Grace Church Senior Living and Dayton Housing LLC.

Mr. Kinskey said the positive impacts of reorganization will include redundant staff coverage for every neighborhood/geographic area, reduced backlog and response time to resident complaints and adequate staffing to conduct a city-wide housing condition survey with trained staff (first survey in more than five years). He said the housing court change to administrative process will Implement a civil administrative hearing process for property ownership, anticipate to issue RFP in the first quarter of 2023 for software to assist with requisite document processing requirements

Mr. Kinskey said the digitization of building services plans examination process  
Anticipate acquiring a software funded through CDBG-CV to enable electronic documents review

Ms. Jones said the differences between the temporary and original appropriation includes a \$23M increase over the 2022 original appropriation and a \$293.4M increase over the 2023 temporary appropriation which was passed on December 10, 2022. She said the increase is largely due to a carry over budget in capital and non-operating funds.

Ms. Jones said the public notice of the public hearing was published in the paper on Sunday, January 15, 2023, appropriations will be published in its entirety on February 5, 2023, Mayor's State of the City Address will take place on February 8, 2023, the first reading is scheduled for February 15, 2023, the second reading is scheduled for February 22, 2023, and the effective date will be March 24, 2023.

### **CITIZENS' COMMENTS ON THE PUBLIC HEARING**

Citizen comments on the public hearing were received from the following:

1. **Ms. Valerie Duncan, 523 Hayden Ave.** – asked the City Commission to commit more money from the budget to neighborhoods.
2. **Ms. Nancy Kiehl, 309 Hacker Road** – read a letter from the Clergy Committee Coalition regarding the closing of Premier Health Hospital (Good Samaritan) and the lack of medical care in the Northwest area of the City of Dayton.
3. **Ms. Jo Love, No Address** - read a letter from the Clergy Committee Coalition regarding the closing of Premier Health Hospital (Good Samaritan) and the lack of medical care in the Northwest area of the City of Dayton.
4. **Ms. Kathleen Galt, 5066 Safeway Dr.** - read a letter from the Clergy Committee Coalition regarding the closing of Premier Health Hospital (Good Samaritan) and the lack of medical care in the Northwest area of the City of Dayton.
5. **Dr. Merritt Worthen, 138 Wetherburn Dr.** - read a letter from the Clergy Committee Coalition regarding the closing of Premier Health Hospital (Good Samaritan) the budget and the lack of medical care in the Northwest area of the City of Dayton.



6. **Bishop Richard Cox, 1453 Liscum Dr.** – spoke regarding the closing of Premier Health Hospital (Good Samaritan) the budget and the lack of medical care in the Northwest area of the City of Dayton.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said the briefing that was provided at the hearing is not the same briefing that was received during the Work Session on November 23, 2022. She said she asked for the chart to be provided before the public hearing today. She said she still needs time to review and digest in their entirety.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about the Guiding Budget Principles and Assumptions and where it states *Departmental allocations are based on City Commission priorities, City Manager recommendations, departmental inputs, performance management KPIs, and funding mandates* she wanted to know how the categories are prioritized and pushed forward and what programs and projects will be funded.

Ms. Dickstein said this is the first part of the budget process and it is used culminate the draft budget which was presented in the six hours of work sessions in December.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said they have City Commission priorities and City Manager Recommendations she asked how the information is captured and identified as to priorities.

Ms. Dickstein said the information is captured in the departmental budget and presented to the City Commission in the Work Sessions.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked who determines the departmental budget regarding the perimeters.

Ms. Dickstein said the perimeters are set by the information that is captured around wages, benefits, personnel, contracts, and materials. She said those are the perimeters that are sent to department directors who present a draft budget to management and budget staff who analysis and submits them to the City Manager's office who review the information for unintended consequences or significant priorities, then a draft budget is put together for City Commission review.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked how it is communicated to directors what the City Commission priorities are.

Ms. Dickstein said the City Commission objectives have not changed over the last few budgets. She said they also discussed and confirmed the performance management update.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked after all the perimeters are addressed what is identified as the programming and projects that is needed to meet the City Commission priorities.

Ms. Dickstein said it is a collective effort that is captured through budget conversations and reviews with the City Manager's office.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said she has identified areas of concern in the budget that has not been addressed. She asked how all the City Commission priorities are are being addressed. She also wanted to know what the initial budget was before commission priorities were applied. Ms. Dickstein gave an overview of the process and said the City Manager's office is there as oversight to make sure nothing has fallen through the cracks.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about the unfulfilled positions request by departments.

Ms. Dickstein said they are filling critical positions and they are putting contracts in place. She said they currently have 200 positions that they have been authorized to fill but cannot be filled do to shortage of workers.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about inputs to the budget that Ms. Dickstein spoke about.

Ms. Dickstein said she was talking about collective input they try to balance with needs and priorities.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about software that would score and keep track of or prioritize inputs and identify what areas are imperative for the budget.

Ms. Dickstein said no that is the work of Procurement, Management and Budget, City Manager's office and the City Commission.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said that is her concern that there is not a transparent process in place to identify how they are scoring and collecting all the data. She said there should be software in place that collects data and analyze what should be a priority.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked Ms. Dickstein about the projected GAP with regards to ARPA funds

Ms. Dickstein said this is the impact of work from home they anticipated seeing in the City of Dayton.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked if Ms. Dickstein could provide details on the CBDG discretionary funds.

Ms. Dickstein said every two years they do a competitive discretionary funding process. She said applications go before the Community Neighborhood and Development advisory board who scores and ranks the projects and then they come before the City Manager for recommendation to the City Commission.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about the \$46.9M budget including \$1M for additional service and staff for Fire. She asked about the staffing levels after the Department of Justice suit against the City of Dayton.

Ms. Dickstein said she will follow-up with details which she said she doesn't know if that is accurate.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about charts being left out of the presentation to the City Commission.

Ms. Dickstein said they were left out because they had already been talked about.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said the concerns were provided well in advance. She said conversations with Fire and the Human Relations Council have been going on for a quite some time. She said she understands the details, but it is a different briefing than what they receive on Monday.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about going from ALS to BLS and why it's being categorized as a pilot program.

Ms. Dickstein said she does not agree with the statement they are downgrading she said most of the runs are basic life support. She said advance life support requires a paramedics attention. She said they are trying to match their service level with their demand and that is pilot program piece.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said for the record there are still concerns regarding Engine 10 and Medic 10. She said she appreciates Chief Lykins overview but is still has not addressed the service that is needed for Edgemont Carillon area.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about funding for contracts and materials at the Human Relations Council with regards to City Commission priorities.

Ms. Dickstein said funds for the Human Relations Council for contracts and materials was not expended fully in 2022. She said there was good conversation between budget staff and HRC to look at contracts and materials and continue to monitor and make recommendations.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about staffing levels prior to 2019.

Ms. Dickstein said they have been the same with minus MBAC because they have had contractors for the last five years.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said that was a concern because the disparity report identifies that the Human Relations Council does not have adequate staffing to meet obligations and commitments, or priorities set before the department by the City Commission.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked about the Fair Housing Assistance Program (FHAP) and why did the model change.

Ms. Dickstein said the reporting and tracking is very onerous because of the CDBG compliance requirements. She said there issues with compliance, and it is a cumbersome funding source.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said the compliance was for the DBE and she wants to revisit the issue because of discrepancy of calculating the time.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss said Issue 9 was voted on to improve the services of police and fire. She asked why fire station ten was browned out.

Ms. Dickstein said Issue 9 was a commitment to maintain existing service levels for the Dayton Fire Department.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked how properties are being tracked that have been demolished or is committed for demolition.

Ms. Dickstein said demolition properties are prioritized by the area, structures condition and cost.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked for an update on the Daymont West building, the convenience store on Xenia avenue, and the Preferred Property program. She asked about the housing complaints and how they are being tracked and closed out.

Ms. Dickstein said they may use the Excela portal to see where the complaint is in the process.

Commissioner Fairchild thanked staff said he recognizes the hard work that is involved in the budget process.

Commissioner Fairchild asked for chart nine to include in future for the actual total operating budget which would be helpful since modifications happen throughout the year.

Commissioner Fairchild said it was not fair that to lump things under youth investments when some money goes to capital improvements to parks, recreation centers and golf which is used by all citizens not just youth. He said they are spending money on youth but is it the most effective way to spend money. He said he appreciates Commissioner Shaw recognizing that there is 11 months of conversation in preparation for the budget and he said that means the 2024 budget conversations will take place in February. Commissioner Fairchild asked for a clear understanding of the investment in youth.

Commissioner Fairchild asked about the authorized strength number.

Ms. Dickstein said they were at that number which is 308.

He asked about the additional EMT's and firefighters.

Ms. Dickstein said that is a temporary overfill which takes the number over the authorized strength.

Commissioner Fairchild asked if an assessment be done since Station 10 is browned out and impacted the hardest by disinvestment.

Ms. Dickstein said the assessment is taking place continuously. She said software was bought to evaluate run volume. She said they will provide an updated memo to the City Commission.

Commissioner Fairchild asked about the staffing levels of the Human Relations Council. He said the HRC was operating understaff at the time of restructuring, transferring three Welcome Dayton staff persons.

Ms. Dickstein said she will provide a five-year breakdown of staffing levels for the Human Relations Council.

Commissioner Fairchild asked about the solution regarding the PEP program and getting certified applicant to bid.

Ms. Dickstein said Ms. Fields would be the best person to answer that question. She said as far as the budget is concerned that is where a position went into the BTA to provide technical assistance.

Ms. Fields said this is a three-person team, they have a business and technical assistance administrator and two contract compliance specialists, and those positions fluctuated because

there were vacancies over the past few years, but they are filled now. She said those three positions are largely responsible for overseeing the entire program and most of their role, is around the certification and their work is for local, state and federal certifications.

Commissioner Fairchild said there have been memos stating the HRC is not adequately funded. He said if they really want to identify the obstacles to overcome both increase capacity and get people to be successful. He said it seems like they are at the same funding for the past five years and haven't been able to identify the obstacles and that intervention is needed.

Ms. Fields said holistically it is a city initiative that does not reside just within HRC. She said there are recommendations, not just to Dayton, but overall, for jurisdictions who have programs like this is to look at reporting. She said how they are being transparent with the inclusion spend is they are increasing the goals one of the things that they really look at is the disparity in the overall marketplace, where are the opportunities, and how many certified companies there are that are willing to do business in the City of Dayton

Commissioner Fairchild asked about the \$3.4M and could it be placed back into the \$15.8M which help would help with the \$7M gap.

Ms. Dickstein said it was always captured as part of the \$12.4M for demolition and it's been consistent.

Commissioner Fairchild said in a previous presentation it was said that they would spend \$15.8M to demolish 850 properties. He said it is a reallocation of \$3.4M.

Ms. Dickstein said she will take another look because she might have misspoken. She said out of the Dayton Recovery Plan \$15M was designated for demolition activities.

Commissioner Fairchild asked how the budget compromises get made. He said it feels like policy decisions are being made on the administrative side rather than coming back to elected officials.

Ms. Dickstein said they are not policy decisions rather recommendations as part of the budget process because of the knowledge of the organization and departmental needs are. She said they do their very best to put forward the needs and concerns of the departments.

Commissioner Fairchild said he appreciates the work, but the time is short for the elected officials to see the budget and sort through and figure out where the tradeoffs are. He said going forward he thinks it will be helpful to know the last items in the budget and the last items out of the budget, what is the scope of unfunded items in a comprehensive way, capital personnel capacity programs, fixed spending and discretionary spending.

Ms. Dickstein said that is part of the processes being discussed she said she hopes that will clarify the bigger picture.

Commissioner Fairchild asked Ms. Hollingsworth to get assessment needs from 2018 that each hospital is required to perform. He said that would be helpful to understand some of the concerns that the CCC raised.

Ms. Dickstein said Dayton Montgomery County Public Health does a needs assessment county wide every three years.

Commissioner Shaw said the City Commission makes hard decisions during especially during the budget process. He thanked staff for their work on the budget and his colleagues for asking questions. He said it will be helpful to the community for understanding. Commissioner Shaw said with Fire is an area that is hard to make difficult decisions and choices.

Commissioner Shaw asked Ms. Fields is the Human Relations Council fully funded and and fully staffed.

Ms. Fields said all of her positions are staffed and funded.

Commissioner Shaw asked if she knows how to ask for more funding and staff.

Commissioner Joseph said during the life of the pilot program 61 percent of the time the extra transport unit was staffed as an ALS unit, the more advanced unit. He thanked staff for their work on the budget.

Mayor Mims thanked staff for their work on the budget and the level of detail. He asked everyone to remember the questions and answers. He listed positive positions Dayton has found itself in median income increase, Dayton ranked one of the top five cities in the nation for affordable cities, Forbes Magazine number one city to buy a starter home, and Technology Talent growth. He said the budget gives an opportunity to continue to grow.

Mayor Mims closed the hearing.

### **CITIZENS' COMMENTS**

Citizen comments were received from the following:

1. **Mr. Steve Post, 145 Warren St.** – spoke in support of fire apparatus Engine 10 and Medic 10.
2. **Mr. Willie Feaster, No Address** – spoke about homicides in the City of Dayton.

### **COMMENTS BY THE CLERK OF COMMISSION**

The Clerk of Commission, Ms. Regina Blackshear, had no closing comments.

### **COMMENTS BY THE CITY MANAGER**

The City Manager, Ms. Shelley Dickstein, thanked Public Works at the airport and in the city of Dayton for their service to their community.

### **COMMENTS BY THE CITY COMMISSION**

#### **Commissioner Turner-Sloss**

Commissioner Turner-Sloss thanked Public Works for their work on snow removal in the City of Dayton.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss thanked presenters and citizens for voicing their concerns at the meeting.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked again for an update on the Clergy Community Coalition and their application for ARPA funds. She said the Northwest Healthcare is a priority for her.

Commissioner Turner-Sloss asked what the next steps for the questions that were asked during the public hearing on the budget.

Ms. Dickstein said there will be a follow-up briefing memo via email.

**Commissioner Fairchild**

Commissioner Fairchild asked for clarification on the budget discussions.

Commissioner Joseph said they could speak with one another and or have the commissioners speak with the Clerk or Director to give their input on the budget.

Commissioner Fairchild asked for the Human Relations Council if they could look back ten years on the FTE's to see how the data has evolved. He also said there is still a week link around the budget process especially dealing with evaluation and making sure they are spending dollars that are affecting the outcomes they want.

Commissioner Fairchild highlighted various events happening around the city, Les Miz, live music, theater productions, sledding at Lohrey Park.

**Commissioner Shaw**

Commissioner Shaw said there are great job opening for the City of Dayton which can be found at [jobs.daytonohio.gov](http://jobs.daytonohio.gov).

**Commissioner Joseph**

Commissioner Joseph thanked his colleagues for their support for the Independent Accountability Auditor (IAA).

**Mayor Mims**

Mayor Mims said the Human Relations Council has had tremendous growth in meeting the goals that has been set by that department.

Mayor Mims thanked President Joe Biden and Vice President Kamala Harris for their hospitality at the White House in Washington D.C.

Mayor Mims highlighted his attendance at the Black Box Theatre.

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:13 a.m.

---

**Jeffrey J. Mims, Jr.**  
**Mayor**

**Attest:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Clerk of Commission**